

# *Great Books Symposium Journal*

## A Wright College Publication for Community College Students

### Manuscript Evaluation

Manuscript Number:

Return by:

Title of Essay:

---

Please score the essay from 1 to 5 (1 is low, 5 is high)

**Quality of Argument:** Consider complexity of thesis, logic of argumentation, organization, and—when evident or necessary—engagement with contrasting points of view.

1      2      3      4      5

Comments:

**Possible Contribution to the Field:** To what extent is the thesis original, and/or might it add something to our understanding of the subject?

1      2      3      4      5

Comments:

**Quality of Composition:** Does the essay use academic style, formal tone, as well as proper grammar, punctuation, and mechanics?

1      2      3      4      5

Comments:

**Support for Argument and Analysis:** Does the essay use sufficient primary source quotations followed by analysis that supports the thesis?

1      2      3      4      5

Comments:

**Quality of Scholarship:** Are the secondary sources from recognized, peer-reviewed journals and presses?

1    2    3    4    5

Comments:

**Currency of Scholarship:** To what extent is the essay informed by current scholarship? Are at least half of the secondary sources from the 21<sup>st</sup> century?

1    2    3    4    5

Comments:

**Conformity to Style Guide:** Does the paper correctly use MLA formatting, including parenthetical citation and works cited?

1    2    3    4    5

Comments:

---

## PUBLICATION DECISION

\_\_\_\_ Accept (with minor revisions indicated above)

\_\_\_\_ Revise and resubmit (suggestions indicated above and/or in the letter to the author, below)

\_\_\_\_ Do not accept (reasons indicated above and/or in the letter to the author, below)

**Reviewer's Name:**

**Email Address:**

You might wish to put your comments in the form of a friendly letter, indicating strengths of the submission and suggesting constructive and concrete revisions. **You will remain anonymous to the student.**

PLEASE BE SURE TO RETURN ALL FORMS BY THE REQUESTED DATE. THANK YOU FOR YOUR TIME AND YOUR PROFESSIONALISM.

## REVIEWER COMMENTS TO AUTHOR

(Please address the author directly, and use extra pages as necessary.)